**CANADIAN DENTAL REGULATORY AUTHORITIES FEDERATION**

**MINUTES OF MEETING**

**BOARD OF DIRECTORS**

Wednesday, April 22, 2020

Via Zoom videoconference

A meeting of the CDRAF Board of Directors took place on Wednesday, April 22, 2020 at 11:00 a.m. EDT.

**PARTICIPANTS:**

Dr. Maurice Coady, Registrar, (CDRAF Vice-Chair), Dental Council of Prince Edward Island

Dr. Randall Croutze, Chief Executive Officer, Alberta Dental Association and College

Ms. Caroline Daoust, Directrice générale et secretaire, (CDRAF Treasurer)‎, L’Ordre des dentistes du Québec

Mr. Irwin Fefergrad, Registrar, Royal College of Dental Surgeons of Ontario

Ms. Andréa Foti, Assistant Registrar, Royal College of Dental Surgeons of Ontario

Dr. Martin Gillis, Registrar, Provincial Dental Board of Nova Scotia

Dr. Chris Hacker, Registrar, College of Dental Surgeons of British Columbia

Mr. Dan Leger, Registrar, (CDRAF Chair) New Brunswick Dental Society

Dr. Arun Misra, Acting Registrar, Manitoba Dental Association

Dr. Paul O’Brien, Registrar, Newfoundland and Labrador Dental Board

Dr. Mitch Taillon, Associate Registrar, College of Dental Surgeons of Saskatchewan

**STAFF:**

Dr. Jack Gerrow, CDRAF Executive Director

Ms. Angie Sherban, CDRAF Executive Assistant

**OBSERVERS:**

Dr. Dan Albert, Chair, Provincial Dental Board of Nova Scotia

Dr. Paul Allison, Executive Director, Association of Canadian Faculties of Dentistry

Dr. Nancy Auyeung, CDRAF representative to CDAC

Dr. Mintoo Basahti, Past-President, Alberta Dental Association and College

Ms. Lee Callen, Commission on Dental Accreditation of Canada

Dr. Christopher Cottick, Vice-President, Manitoba Dental Association

Dr. Marie Dagenais, Registrar/Executive Director, National Dental Examining Board of Canada

Mr. Frédéric Duguay, Director, Commission on Dental Accreditation of Canada

Dr. Dennis Fuchs, President, National Dental Examining Board of Canada

Dr. Guy LaFrance, President, L’Ordre des dentistes du Québec

Dr. Todd Graham, President, College of Dental Surgeons of Saskatchewan

Mr. Rafi Mohammed, Executive Director, Manitoba Dental Association

Dr. Marc Mollot, President, Manitoba Dental Association

Ms. Kim Phillips, Manager, Communications, National Dental Examining Board of Canada

Colonel Jean-Pierre Picard, Royal Canadian Dental Corps.

Dr. Amarjit Rihal, President, Commission on Dental Accreditation of Canada

Dr. Flavio Turchet, President, Royal College of Dental Surgeons of Ontario

Dr. Bruce Yaholnitcky, Alberta Dental Association & College

1. **CALL TO ORDER**

The Chair, Mr. Leger, called the meeting to order at 11:00 a.m.

**2. APPROVAL OF AGENDA**

The agenda was approved, as circulated:

 **MOTION #1: Coady/Gillis**

**THAT the agenda of the meeting of April 22, 2020 be approved, as circulated.**

***CARRIED***

*(Unanimously)*

**3. APPROVAL OF MINUTES**

CDRAF Board Meeting – January 20, 2020

The minutes were adopted, as circulated.

**4. BUSINESS ARISING**

4.1 National Dental Specialty Examination (NDSE) Update

Ms. Phillips provided a verbal update on the NDSE. She reported that the National Dental Examining Board of Canada (NDEB) is progressing with the Royal College of Dentists of Canada (RCDC) in developing the NDSE.

Due to the global pandemic, the examination scheduled for June had to be cancelled, but there are good options for it to be administered in September. The examination will be held in paper format.

NDEB was thanked for its ongoing work with implementation of the NDSE this year.

4.2 Implications of Manitoba Dental Association (MDA) Proposed By-Law Revisions

Mr. Leger reported on the productive meeting that was held with members of the MDA Executive Committee on April 3, 2020. It was an opportunity to learn about the MDA’s ratification process and sharing of the implications the MDA proposed by-law revisions would have on other jurisdictions and the Agreement on Internal Trade (AIT).

Dr. Misra reported that in Manitoba, unlike other dental regulatory authorities, the bylaws are required to be ratified by the membership through a consultative process for 30 days. During that period, ten or more members can request that a meeting be called for ratification. If approved, the revised by-law will come into effect on May 5, 2020.

At the end of the discussion with MDA, it was obvious that a number of RCDC members in Manitoba are trying to support the RCDC.

Dr. Gerrow reported that following the discussion with MDA, Dr. Hugh Lamont of the RCDC was contacted regarding the RCDC Fellowship examination and he was not aware of the issues with portability. He confirmed that it was not the intention of RCDC to be have the Fellowship Examination considered an examination recognized for licensure. RCDC supports NDEB in administering the NDSE.

Dr. Mollot asked that if RCDC agrees that the RCDC Fellowship examination is an adjunct to the NDSE, it be encouraged to state this in writing. RCDC may not be amenable to make a statement in writing, but rather it was suggested that RCDC amend its provisions that a member would have to pass the NDSE as a pre-requisite to obtaining Fellowship.

It was agreed that there needs to be a commonality of registration practices across the country. The RCDC recognized that Fellowship was not an acceptable examination and it created the NDSE. At no time did the RCDC purport that the two examinations were equal.

It was stated that if a province has a different examination that is not an equivalent entry level exam, this may raise concerns in those provinces with Fairness Commissioners for unintended consequences that would affect the national examination process. It would also apply to general dentists.

4.3 NDEB – Written OSCE

Ms. Phillips reported that NDEB was originally planning to schedule its first virtual Objective Structured Clinical Examination (OSCE) in March 2021; however, although the examination is ready, there have been some technology issues identified and it will now be delayed until March 2022. The ACJ examination has been moved from Spring 2020 to the Fall potentially.

4.4 Report on ACFD Meetings, March 5-7, 2020

Dr. Croutze, Ms. Daoust and Ms. Foti attended two meetings with the Association of Canadian Faculties of Dentistry (ACFD) in Vancouver on March 5 and 6, 2020.

The first meeting was with the Deans Committee on March 5, 2020. Communication from the DRAs to their stakeholders was the key focus of this discussion. Dr. Croutze, Ms. Daoust and Ms. Foti explained the history behind the reasons for requesting that NDEB be responsible for the NDSE and the discussions held with the Commission on Dental Accreditation of Canada (CDAC). They encouraged Dr. Allison and Dr. Gerrow to build a good communication process and keep the Deans fully informed of the CDRAF work.

At that meeting, there was discussion on the national competency initiative. There appeared to be a misunderstanding of the mandate of the Working Group struck to review current competencies and draft a new document

On the second day there was a meeting with representatives from the four leadership groups of CDRAF, ACFD, CDAC and NDEB.

CDAC explained how it was moving forward with a new governance structure and its separation from the Canadian Dental Association (CDA).

There was also discussion on the proposed by-law revision by the Manitoba Dental Association.

The four groups recognized the importance of good communication amongst the stakeholders. It was felt that this meeting was a good opportunity to express concerns in a constructive manner. There was agreement that communication needs to improve both provincially and nationally.

Dr. Allison reminded the CDRAF Board that there have been two or three joint meetings of the Registrars and Deans held over the past year, but unfortunately these meeting have been interrupted by the pandemic. It was suggested that the Deans be invited to join the Registrars every two or three months during one of the weekly (Thursday at 4pm EDT) Zoom meetings. Dr. Allison undertook to speak to the ACFD leadership regarding this suggestion and, if agreeable, he and Dr. Gerrow will arrange for regular meetings. Elected members are welcome to participate in the discussions as well.

Some of the Registrars reiterated that they have regular discussions and ongoing communication with the Dean(s) in their provinces, but they agreed it is good for the Registrars and Deans to meet periodically with an agenda. There was discussion on whether the discussions in individual provinces should be shared with the other DRAs.

4.5 National Competencies

Dr. Allison reported that ACFD feels the progress on this project has been slow. It is recognized that the intention is not to develop a completely new competencies document, but rather review and modify (if necessary) the current model. It was agreed to continue with a small group with one representative from each of CDRAF, ACFD, CDAC and NDEB who will meet and draft a framework for the larger group (stakeholders and public) for consideration to determine how to move forward with this initiative.

Ms. Foti reminded the CDRAF Board of the consultation toolkit on non-clinical competencies with the public that is still on hold.

Dr. Allison advised that Dr. Jim Lai will be the ACFD representative. Dr. Gerrow asked the CDRAF Board for a representative as he is the staff resource for this project. Mr. Leger and Dr. Gerrow will discuss and identify a representative. NDEB and CDAC will also be asked to provide the name of a representative from each organization. Dr. Gerrow will convene a meeting for these groups to work on developing a framework, taking into consideration DRA issues and what they would like to see included in the document. The draft framework will be brought back to the CDRAF Board meeting in October.

4.6 Commission on Dental Accreditation of Canada (CDAC)

Dr. Rihal reviewed with the CDRAF Board the written report of CDAC’s activities. He highlighted the following:

* Meetings with the PGY1 Working Group; Office of the Manitoba Fairness Commissioner; joint Working Group with CDRAF to discuss governance and accreditation.
* Regarding governance and CDAC becoming a separate legal entity, it was reported that a Request for Proposal has been circulated for a legal firms specializing in governance and corporate business law.
* CDAC has engaged Brenda Fair of Fairwinds Training to facilitate the process together with a Steering Committee, that will be appointed and include representation from stakeholders.
* It is anticipated the March 2021 timeline will be met.
* Due to the pandemic, travel and site visits have been suspended. Virtual formats have been used where possible.
* There has been virtual reviews with CODA, but this does not replace site visits and it is important to interact with students as well.
* Survey visits of the Canadian Armed Forces dental clinics began in September 2018 and were finalized in mid-January 2019.
* Letters were sent to DRAs requesting them to identify, if any, specific concerns with respect to CDAC’s processes, structure, and governance that helped influence any delay in funding last year. Ontario’s response was included in the resource materials; Dr. Rihal reported that he has received responses from other provinces as well. He will follow up with the other provinces in due course and provide an extended deadline if required.

With regard to the joint Working Group of CDRAF and CDAC, Dr. Gerrow will draft terms of reference and arrange a future meeting. Dr. Gerrow reiterated that the Working Group is populated by DRAs who can include as many representatives as they wish.

4.7 Update on CDRAF/ACFD Joint Working Group on Academic Licensure

Dr. Allison reported that a document has been compiled of each jurisdiction’s regulations and by-laws and it will be up to the individual Deans and DRAs in each province to determine how this is implemented. There was nothing further to report at this time.

4.8 Direct to Consumer Initiatives

Dr. Misra reported that the SmileDirectClub lawsuit with MDA continues to be an active file. There were no further updates to report on direct to consumer initiatives.

4.9 National Recognition of Dental Specialties

The CDRAF Board was provided with draft copies of the Process for Recognition of a New Dental Specialty in English and in French. Mr. Leger reminded that Board that this revised document was discussed again at the Board meeting on January 20, 2020 when CDRAF Board members were asked to take the revised draft document back to their respective Boards/Councils for approval to circulate. When approved, in principle, the document will then be posted on the CDRAF website (in both languages) for consultation.

Dr. Hacker undertook to draft a briefing note to accompany the draft when it is presented to DRAs for approval to circulate for comments.

5. COVID-19

Mr. Leger reported that the Registrars hold weekly videoconference meetings to discuss COVID-19 and how DRAs are managing in each of the jurisdictions. The Registrars agreed that it has been a good format for sharing information and discussion.

Dr. Gerrow provided the CDRAF Board with summaries on Definition of Emergencies and on the Current Status for Provision of Emergency Care in each jurisdiction for information. He asked Registrars to provide him with any updates and he would revise the summaries.

There was discussion on preparing protocols for dentists returning to practice, as well as the shortage of PPEs, particularly N-95 masks.

Ontario was asked who drives the decisions made for its members. Mr. Fefergrad stated that the RCDSO has a team of staff members (including dentists with expertise in infection prevention and control). It obtains guidance from the Ministry of Health and the Chief Medical Officer of Health. Staff have daily contact with the Ministry of Health. Government has been clear that it is concerned about a second wave of COVID-19 which is predicted to be worse than the first wave. The RCDSO is looking to engage an expert in infectious disease as a consultant. There are concerns about opening up dental practices too soon and when they do, it will have to be a staged approach.

There was discussion on various resources related to opening practices and it was agreed that the Registrars would share this information with each other.

It was agreed that a national framework be drafted for all DRAs to use when opening up dental offices. It was recognized that some of the smaller provinces will be opening up sooner. Mr. Fefergrad recommended an infection disease specialist, Dr. Stephen Shafran (from Alberta) as a good resource to consult with. He presented to CDRAF some years ago on blood borne pathogens.

It was agreed to have the Registrars discuss this further at its next Zoom meeting on April 30, 2020.

6. Financial

The CDRAF Board was provided with the draft Auditor’s letter and draft financial statements for CDRAF, as at December 31, 2019.

Dr. Gerrow reviewed the financial statements. The auditor’s letter confirmed that no issues with the statements were found. In response to a question, Dr. Gerrow advised that the operating fee for 2021 has not been set yet, and would be included in the draft budget that will be presented to the CDRAF Board in August.

 **MOTION: Daoust/Croutze**

 **THAT the CDRAF Board approves the 2019 CDRAF financial**

**statements, as at December 31, 2019, attached at APPENDIX E of the CDRAF Board materials, April 22, 2020 meeting.**

**CARRIED**

*(Unanimously)*

7. CDRAF Representatives and Observers at other Meetings

The CDRAF Board was provided with a revised schedule for its information.

 8. CDRAF By-Laws and Guidelines on Meetings

 This was included as resource material.

 Included in this item was correspondence from the Manitoba Dental Association requesting that a governance review be done of CDRAF by a committee comprised of elected representatives from each DRA. Dr. Misra added that moving forward it is recommended having a Working Group look at the current governance structure of CDRAF with the intention of including elected officials.

 Several of the Board members expressed that they were not in favour of another governance revision. They reported on the background of how CDRAF was first structured where the Board was comprised of Registrars and elected members and how inefficient that format had been. Some of the challenges in having elected members be part of the Board was that there was inconsistency in the terms of elected members resulting in a lack of corporate memory and limited knowledge of regulatory issues.

Mr. Fefegrad advised that Ontario would not participate in any discussion on changing the governance structure. He stated that the current structure of the CDRAF Board has worked well since 2017 when it was revised to be comprised of the Registrars, however, elected members are able to attend meetings as observers. Dr. Turchet was in support of Mr. Fefergrad’s statement that the current governance structure was working and did not need to be altered.

Ms. Daoust reminded that any recommendations made by the CDRAF Board have to be taken to the DRAs’ Boards/Councils for final approval.

Dr. Croutze was in favour of conducting a review of the governance structure to include more involvement of elected members and felt that this partnership is important.

 Dr. Leger summarized that the current governance structure is working well and that the majority of the Board members are not in favour of a review, except for Manitoba and Alberta who made statements. It was noted that communication from CDRAF needs to improve, but this would not require a by-law amendment.

 Dr. Basahti asked if representatives from Alberta and Manitoba could provide written suggestions to the CDRAF Board on how they felt the governance of CDRAF could be improved for its review and consideration at its next Board meeting. This was agreed to.

 9. CDRAF Strategic Plan

This was included as resource material. If the August 2020 Board meeting can be held in person, the strategic plan will be reviewed at that time. If not, this review will have to be deferred until the next available Board meeting in person.

10. New Business

10.1 IELTS

The CDRAF Board was provided with correspondence regarding a fraudulent IELTS English Proficiency Test reported in Ontario. This was provided for information and there was no discussion on this item.

10.2 Dental Industry of Canada

Correspondence from Dentistry Industry Association of Canada (DIAC) was provided for the CDRAF Board’s information. Dr. Gerrow undertook to follow-up with DIAC regarding its roundtable discussions on COVID-19.

11. Next Meeting

The next CDRAF Board meeting is scheduled on Thursday and Friday, August 20-21, 2020 in Edmonton. Due to the circumstances of the global pandemic, it was agreed to hold the meeting on Thursday, August 20, 2020 at 11:00 a.m. EDT via videoconference.

The date for the CDRAF Members’ Representatives Meeting and CDRAF Board Meeting will remain Friday, October 16, 2020 to be held at the RCDSO offices in Toronto, depending on the state of the pandemic at that time.

12. Adjournment

Mr. Leger thanked everyone for participating in the meeting.

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 1:50 p.m.

AMS:977080v3